



# PRINCE GEORGE'S COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

County Administration Building • 14741 Governor Oden Bowie Drive, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor, Upper Marlboro, Maryland 20772  
pgplanning.org/HPC.htm • 301-952-3680

**APPROVED 11/17/20**

## Summary of Actions

Prince George's County Historic Preservation Commission  
Tuesday, October 20, 2020, 6:30 p.m.  
4<sup>th</sup> Floor Board Room, County Administration Building

**THIS MEETING WAS HELD VIRTUALLY VIA GOTOMEETING**

Commissioners Present:	Vice Chair Lisa Pfueller Davidson, Royal Reff Susan Pruden, Yolanda Muckle, Aaron Marcavitch, Chairman John Peter Thompson, Nathania Branch- Miles, Donna Schneider
Commissioners Absent:	N/A
HPC Counsel:	Bradley Farrar, Esq.
Staff Present:	Howard Berger, Jennifer Stabler, Tom Gross, Tyler Smith, Ashley Hall

<b>Guest: Name/Organization</b>	<b>Agenda Item</b>
Steve Corkill	C.1.
Tim Simpson	C.1.
Brian Callicott	C.1.

### A. Call to Order

Chairman Thompson called the meeting to order at 6:34 p.m. Vice Chair Davidson read introductory remarks about the meeting and procedures into the record. Vice Chair Davidson chaired the meeting.

### B. Approval of Meeting Summary – September 15, 2020

**MOTION:** Commissioner Schneider moved to approve the September 15, 2020 meeting summary. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Pruden. The motion was approved by roll-call vote and without objection (6-0-1, Commissioner Branch-Miles voted “present”). Commissioner Muckle arrived after the motion was approved.

## C. Historic Area Work Permit

### 1. 2020-058, Jarboe-Bowie House (Historic Site 79-019-02)

Mr. Gross presented the staff report. The applicant requested an after-the-fact Historic Area Work Permit (HAWP) for alterations and repairs to the Jarboe-Bowie House. Built circa 1852, the Jarboe-Bowie House is a two-story, side-gabled frame dwelling with small second-story windows, wood-shingle roof, and interior gable-end chimneys. It was the home of William A. Jarboe, Clerk of the County Court and Register of Wills, and was later owned by the Bowie family from 1882 to 1961. In addition to its status as a historic site, the subject property is protected by a preservation easement conveyed by the property owner to the Maryland-National Capital Park and Planning Commission (M-NCPPC) and recorded in the Land Records of Prince George's County on March 23, 2012. The conveyance of this easement was required by the property owner's receipt of an award through the Historic Property Grant Program, which the property owner used to partially reimburse the cost of acquiring the property. A subsequent grant was awarded to the property owner to aid in the rehabilitation of the property, the parameters of which are defined in the 2012 easement contract, a 2017 rehabilitation agreement, and HAWPs approved by the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) in January 2015 and December 2018. Concurrent with this HAWP application, the property owner has requested after-the-fact approval for the same work items from M-NCPPC through its Easement Committee. As of the date of the HPC meeting, no action had been taken by the Easement Committee to approve or disapprove the work. The applicant seeks after-the-fact approval for the removal of aluminum siding on the east and west side elevations of the house and the replacement of the concealed historic wood lap siding with cementitious siding. The scope of work approved by the HPC in December 2018 (HAWP 2018-086) includes "the repair and (as needed) in-kind replacement of the wood siding." Further, HPC Policy #1-05, "The Use of Synthetic or Composition Siding, Fencing Materials, and Windows," states that "modern synthetic or composition exterior materials shall not be used to cover or to replace historic exterior sheathing or for repairs of features of a historic building... In the case of severe deterioration of exterior sheathing (beyond reasonable repair), the use of in-kind sheathing material of traditional design, material and installation is always preferred for the historic components of a building or complex of buildings." The applicant also seeks after-the-fact approval for the removal of three windows on the east elevation and two windows on the west elevation, which the applicant represents were installed in the 1960s and 1970s, and the replacement of said windows with vinyl, simulated-divided-lite sash windows with six-over-six internal grilles. The scope of work approved in HAWP 2018-086 includes "restoration of the front windows" but no alteration or replacement of any windows on the side or rear elevations. Further, HPC Policy #1-05 states that "replacement windows fabricated of vinyl, aluminum, or other synthetics are generally incompatible with the architectural character of historic buildings and diminish their historic character." Further, the applicant seeks after-the-fact approval for the replacement of historic wood German siding with new cedar lap siding on the front elevation; the in-kind replacement of two historic six-over-six, wood sash windows on the first story of the front elevation; and the replacement of three historic wood sash windows on the second story of the front elevation with true-divided-light wood casement windows. The owner represented that this window type is recommended for the purpose of providing emergency egress. The scope of work approved in HAWP 2018-086 includes "restoration of the front windows" and "repair and (as needed) in-kind replacement of the wood siding." That HAWP does not approve replacement of the front elevation windows, nor can the cedar lap siding that was installed be considered an in-kind replacement for the historic German siding because of its substantially different profile. Finally, the applicant sought after-the-fact approval for emergency repairs to the rear interior chimney on the east side of the house, including rebuilding a portion of the chimney using existing brick and appropriate mortar mix. The applicant clarified to staff that this repair affected a limited area of the outer chimney wall below the roofline and that no repair or alteration has been made to the portion of the chimney visible from the exterior. At no time before the above-referenced work commenced did the applicant request

approval for any change or addition to the scope of work included in HAWP 2018-086, including the installation of new windows or siding for which only repair or restoration had been approved.

The work described above was conducted in violation of HAWP 2018-086, which approved only in-kind replacement (as needed) or repair of the wood siding and no replacement of the side elevation windows, and approves the restoration of the front elevation windows but not their replacement. The use of synthetic siding and window materials also constitutes a violation of HPC Policy #1-05. The lap siding that has been installed is not an in-kind replacement of the historic German siding that previously distinguished the front elevation from the other elevations of the house. The chimney work affects a feature that is not visible from the exterior of the house and therefore does not require approval through the HAWP process. Staff concluded that HAWP 2020-058 cannot be found to meet the HAWP approval criteria of Subtitle 29-111(b). Staff recommended that the HPC deny HAWP 2020-058, in accordance with Subtitle 29-111(a).

Mr. Tim Simpson, owner of the Jarboe-Bowie House, indicated that he is not a historic restoration expert. He indicated that he purchased the property in order to save it. He then indicated that any issues that have occurred were due to ignorance and he highlighted the structural issues the property had when it was purchased. He stated that interior work has been ongoing for several years, and that he was under the impression that the front façade was the most important portion of the property to be restored, and so he focused on that elevation. He stated that he believed that the house originally had clapboard siding and that the German siding had been added later. He indicated that none of the windows were salvageable, and that he was under the impression that he could use the materials of his choice on the east and west elevations of the structure.

Vice Chair Davidson asked Mr. Simpson how his understanding of the project went off track with regard to the preservation of the entire historic exterior envelope. Mr. Simpson indicated that it was his understanding at the time that the front façade was the only portion of the house under historic purview. Vice Chair Davidson indicated that she was concerned about the loss of the German siding, and stated that it appeared that Mr. Simpson did not approach staff about his theory regarding the original siding on the structure. Mr. Simpson stated that he did not ask staff about the installation of the HardiePlank siding.

Chairman Thompson asked if replacing the aluminum siding with new aluminum siding was an option that was discussed when the original HAWP was submitted.

Mr. Simpson provided a letter for the record (Exhibit 1), dated October 13, 2020, indicating support for the project from Ms. Linda Pennoyer, President of the Board of Town Commissioners for the Town of Upper Marlboro.

Mr. Brian Callicott, archivist for the Town of Upper Marlboro Historical Committee, indicated that he felt that if Mr. Simpson had not purchased the Jarboe-Bowie House and taken on the project of restoring it, it would now be in ruinous condition or demolished.

Mr. Steve Corkill, the project architect for the renovation of the Jarboe-Bowie House, indicated that the roof of the house had to be completely reset, and that the entire structure of the house needed to be reworked. He indicated that the renovation has been massive and completely holistic.

Chairman Thompson asked if there was a difference between HardiePlank and wood siding as it relates to structural integrity. Mr. Corkill stated that the side walls support the house from the foundation to the roof and indicated that a clapboard-type siding, particularly the currently installed cementitious siding, is a major part of the structural integrity.

Commissioner Pruden asked staff about the requirement of replacing aluminum windows and siding with original wood materials. Mr. Gross indicated that the replacement materials were a direct violation of HPC policy and clarified that no replacement of side windows had been approved. Commissioner Pruden indicated that she is just excited that the house is not in a ruinous state.

Commissioner Schneider indicated that she wanted to echo what Commissioner Pruden stated. She stated that she drove by the house recently and was happy to see it in a more-sound state.

Commissioner Marcavitch indicated that there was a violation of the HPC's procedures and that the violation needed to be addressed. He asked for suggestions on how this violation could be resolved. Mr. Simpson stated that he could replace the vinyl windows on the eastern elevation with wood windows, though he thought it seemed foolish to remove the HardiePlank.

Chairman Thompson asked staff if any after-the-fact HAWPs had been issued for replaced windows or design changes. He then asked if HardiePlank had ever been approved prior to this application. Mr. Gross indicated that the application of HardiePlank on additions and new construction within historic districts had been approved, but it had not been approved as a replacement for historic wood on a historic portion of a structure. Mr. Gross indicated that HPC policy prohibits the use of HardiePlank and other wood substitutes on historic structures.

Commissioner Pruden asked that, if this HAWP had come in before the work had begun, would the materials have been approved. Mr. Gross indicated that staff would have reviewed the permit against HPC policies. Commissioner Pruden then indicated that she felt that the siding was the real issue aside from not obtaining the proper HAWPs. Mr. Gross clarified that staff's concern was with the replacement of the underlying historic materials located behind the aluminum siding that had been replaced with HardiePlank. Vice Chair Davidson indicated that this was also her concern, and that one of the purposes of the HPC's policies is to retain historic fabric.

Commissioner Reff asked staff for clarification regarding the scope of work covered under the 2018 HAWP (2018-086). Mr. Gross clarified that the 2018 HAWP, which was issued by staff, included the repair and as-needed in-kind replacement of the wood siding and the restoration of the front windows.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Schneider moved that the HPC deny HAWP 2020-058 in accordance with Subtitle 29-111(a). Commissioner Pruden seconded the motion. Commissioner Marcavitch stated that some pushback should occur to deter future issues like this from occurring. Chairman Thompson asked what a denial would entail. The motion was denied by roll call vote (1-6-1, Vice Chair Davidson voted "present" and Commissioner Reff voted "yes"). Discussion followed regarding the HPC's concerns with the violations and how to proceed with a new motion. Commissioner Reff moved that the HPC table HAWP 2020-058 for further consideration at the earliest opportunity. Commissioner Marcavitch seconded the motion. The motion was approved by roll call vote and without objection (6-0-1, Vice Chair Davidson voted "present" and Chairman Thompson abstained).

## **D. Preservation Tax Credits**

### **1. 2020-011, Sunnyside (Historic Site 87B-036-21)**

Mr. Smith presented the staff report. Mr. Robert Klein has applied for a tax credit for work totaling \$21,641.02. The work consisted of the removal of the existing air conditioning system and installation of a new system. The work was conducted in July 2020. Staff determined all expenses to be eligible. Based on the documentation of the work supplied by the applicant and the HPC's adopted tax credit policies and

procedures, staff recommended the approval of a historic preservation tax credit in the amount of \$5,410.25. This credit would apply for FY 2022, the tax year following the year in which the work was completed. Staff recommended that the application be granted as meeting provisions 1, 2, and 3 of Subtitle 29-111(b) and Standards 1 and 2 of the Secretary of the Interior's *Standards for Rehabilitation*.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Schneider moved to approve Preservation Tax Credit 2020-011 as meeting provisions 1, 2, and 3 of Subtitle 29-111(b) and Standards 1 and 2 of the Secretary of the Interior's *Standards for Rehabilitation* in accordance with staff's recommendations. Commissioner Pruden seconded the motion. The motion was approved by roll call vote and without objection (7-0-1, Vice Chair Davidson voted "present").

## 2. 2020-012, Rizzo House (Historic Site 65-015)

Mr. Smith presented the staff report. Ms. Lillian Walker has applied for a tax credit for work totaling \$6,920.00. The work consisted of basement and foundation waterproofing and drainage improvement, including the installation of 71 linear feet of 4" PVC pipe and gravel drainage and a sump pump. The work began in September 2017 and was completed in October 2017. Staff determined all expenses to be eligible. Based on the documentation of the work supplied by the applicant and the HPC's adopted tax credit policies and procedures, staff recommended the approval of a historic preservation tax credit in the amount of \$1,730.00. This credit would apply for FY 2019, the tax year following the year in which the work was completed. Staff recommended that the application be granted as meeting provisions 2, 3, and 4 of Subtitle 29-111(b) and Standards 1 and 2 of the Secretary of the Interior's *Standards for Rehabilitation*.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Schneider moved to approve Preservation Tax Credit 2020-012 as meeting provisions 2, 3, and 4 of Subtitle 29-111(b) and Standards 1 and 2 of the Secretary of the Interior's *Standards for Rehabilitation* in accordance with staff's recommendations. Commissioner Pruden seconded the motion. The motion was approved by roll call vote and without objection (6-0-2, Vice Chair Davidson and Commissioner Branch-Miles voted "present").

## E. Update from Department of Parks & Recreation

Mr. Gross presented the update from the Department of Parks & Recreation.

## F. Commission Staff Items

### 1. HAWP Staff Sign Offs

There were no further questions.

### 2. Properties of Concern

Mr. Gross stated that he and Mr. Smith were planning to visit Bowling Heights soon. Commissioner Schneider asked if there was an update on the work ongoing at Melwood Park and asked if they needed to provide annual or semi-annual reports on the condition of the property. Mr. Gross indicated that, since work is ongoing, reports on the condition are not required. Mr. Berger stated that he can drive by to survey the condition of the property. Mr. Berger stated that it may be appropriate to remove Kildare from the list of Properties of Concern, and Vice Chair Davidson stated that this would be appropriate. Mr. Gross indicated that the roof of the Orme-Shaw house has been replaced. Commissioner Schneider asked for a reminder for

why Bellefields was on the Properties of Concern list. Mr. Berger indicated that it could be removed from the list.

**3. Referrals Report**

There were no further questions.

**4. Correspondence Report – No Correspondence Report**

**5. New Business/Staff Updates**

Vice Chair Davidson recommended attending the Maryland Historical Trust's Architectural Fieldwork Symposium on October 29<sup>th</sup> and 30<sup>th</sup>. Commissioner Marcavitch indicated that the announcement for the availability of the executive director position for the Anacostia Trails Heritage Area would be forthcoming.

Public comments followed and were off the record.

**MOTION:** Chairman Thompson moved to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Pruden. The motion was approved by acclamation and without objection (8-0). The meeting adjourned at 9:01 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Ashley Sayward Hall  
Principal Planning Technician  
Historic Preservation Section

# HPC Meeting Exhibits Log

Tuesday, October 20, 2020

Exhibit Name		Agenda Item	Description
1.	Letter from Linda Pennoyer	C.1.	Letter of support from Linda Pennoyer (President of the Board of Town Commissioners for the Town of Upper Marlboro) dated October 13, 2020



# Town of Upper Marlboro

Town Hall, 14211 School Lane  
Upper Marlboro, MD 20772

Tel: (301) 627-6905  
Fax: (301) 627-2080

[info@uppermarlboromd.gov](mailto:info@uppermarlboromd.gov)  
[www.uppermarlboromd.gov](http://www.uppermarlboromd.gov)

Mailing address: P.O. Box 280 • Upper Marlboro, MD 20773-0280

Tuesday October 13<sup>th</sup>, 2020

Historic Preservation Commission  
14741 Governor Oden Bowie Drive  
Upper Marlboro, MD 20772

Dear Chairman & Commissioners,

I am providing this letter of support for the rehabilitation work conducted by Town resident Mr. Tim Simpson on the historic Jarboe Bowie House currently under construction at 14504 Elm Street, Upper Marlboro MD 20772.

Prior to Mr. Simpson's purchase, this historic property sat vacant, derelict, and literally on the verge of structural collapse. The subject historic site, together with Mr. Simpson's well-maintained and restored designated residence adjacent to the Jarboe Bowie House are important contributors of the Upper Marlboro Residential Historic District.

I am excited to see this historic home's rehabilitation finally take shape. We hope that the Commission continues to assist Mr. Simpson with this project granted he follows the guidelines set by Historic Preservation. Please feel free to reach out to our Town Administrator Kyle Snyder with any questions or concerns. He can be reached at [ksnyder@UpperMarlboroMD.gov](mailto:ksnyder@UpperMarlboroMD.gov) or 301-627-6905 ex1104.

Sincerely,

Linda Penoyer  
President, Board of Town Commissioners  
Town of Upper Marlboro

---

**Janice Duckett**  
Commissioner

**Sarah Franklin**  
Commissioner

**Linda Penoyer**  
Commissioner/President